

THE SECRETARY OF EDUCATION'S COMMISSION
ON THE FUTURE OF HIGHER EDUCATION

+ + + + +

MEETING

+ + + + +

THURSDAY,
AUGUST 10, 2006

+ + + + +

The Commission met in the Barnard Auditorium, U.S. Department of Education, 400 Maryland Avenue, S.W., Washington, D.C., at 10:00 a.m., Charles Miller, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

CHARLES MILLER	Chairman
NICHOLAS DONOFRIO	Commissioner
JAMES J. DUDERSTADT	Commissioner
JONATHAN GRAYER	Commissioner
JAMES B. HUNT, JR.	Commissioner
ARTURO MADRID	Commissioner
ROBERT MENDENHALL	Commissioner
CHARLENE R. NUNLEY	Commissioner
CATHERINE B. REYNOLDS	Commissioner
ARTHUR J. ROTHKOPF	Commissioner
RICHARD STEPHENS	Commissioner
LOUIS W. SULLIVAN	Commissioner
SARA MARTINEZ TUCKER	Commissioner
RICHARD VEDDER	Commissioner
CHARLES M. VEST	Commissioner
DAVID WARD	Commissioner
ROBERT M. ZEMSKY	Commissioner
JOHN BAILEY	Ex Officio
DAVID DUNN	Ex Officio
PETER FALETRA	Ex Officio
CHERYL OLDHAM	Executive Director

	<u>PAGE</u>
I. Introduction and Discussion of Meeting Process	3
II. Update on Process for Production and Transmittal of Final Commission Report	5
III. Motion to Adopt Draft Report	7
IV. Commission Discussion - Follow-up to Report	49
V. Adjourn	65

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(10:08 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN MILLER: Good morning. I call the meeting to order of the Secretary's Commission on the Future of Higher Education.

We have 11 members here. We have a quorum. We are expecting to have six members telephonically. Two are not available by phone, literally, way out of pocket, I've had input from them, which I can report later.

Thank you. Thank you for taking the time, putting this on your calendar, for doing all the hard work. The meeting has a fairly specific purpose to make a decision on the proposed report for the Secretary's Commission on the Future of Higher Education.

Because of the nature of the structure of the meeting, the telephonic and the people in person, and because we've had this extra issue of airport security and people are on the schedule, I'm going to try to be efficient, on time. And I know most of you would be that way, so here's what we would like to do for the meeting.

Staying on plan, I'm going to talk just briefly about the work of the Commission. Cheryl Oldham will talk about the process going forward that

1 would be the legal and operational, and so on, part of
2 the work of the Commission and how we might finish.
3 And then, we'll accept a motion to adopt the report.

4 Governor Hunt, who is in North Carolina,
5 has had some surgery early this week, is prepared to
6 make a motion, and Arturo Madrid to second it. I'm
7 going to read that motion for them at the beginning of
8 it, and then what I'd like to do is for people to have
9 a chance to go around and I'll call on you
10 individually to make a comment, like you'd have a
11 discussion but try to do it in an organized way,
12 comment as briefly as you can make it.

13 And then, as a result of that discussion
14 we would like to have a concluding vote. That would
15 be the purpose of -- so the comments might be helpful
16 if they would be conclusive. Anybody have a question
17 or a comment about that process?

18 Thank you very much.

19 COMMISSIONER HUNT: Mr. Chairman, could
20 you please move a little closer to the microphone?
21 It's very faint.

22 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you. Is that
23 better for you guys?

24 COMMISSIONER HUNT: Yes, that's much
25 better.

26 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thanks. I appreciate

1 that.

2 I believe this is the eighth meeting of
3 the Commission, with six -- the sixth full Commission
4 meeting in 10 months, six locations. We've had a huge
5 volume of input -- reports, e-mails, telephone calls,
6 meetings individually, small group meetings, a large
7 amount of dial-up among ourselves by e-mail or
8 telephone calls, and when I say a large amount I can't
9 understate that.

10 I've never seen a hardworking group -- as
11 hardworking and dedicated a group as this, or a
12 smarter group of people. I thought to myself when the
13 Commission was appointed that if the Secretary wanted
14 to turn over the running of the country to a group
15 this would qualify.

16 (Laughter.)

17 And I feel that way here toward the end.
18 I feel so much confidence, and I want to thank you for
19 that participation. There's a lot to be done in the
20 sense of the follow-up to the report. I think we've
21 put a lot on the table to be done.

22 Cheryl Oldham will tell us now the
23 operational mechanics of the way we can finish our
24 report, assuming we make a decision on the report
25 today.

26 MS. OLDHAM: As the Chairman said,

1 assuming we make a decision here today, it's sort of
2 just the beginning of the end in terms of getting this
3 to a place that you all would feel comfortable
4 presenting it to the Secretary. It clearly is not in
5 that form or that place currently, and so we've got a
6 few steps to go through in terms of copy editing,
7 cleaning it up, graphics, things like that. We've got
8 a contractor who will lay it out. All of these are
9 sort of several processes to get to a complete
10 document that we would then present to the Secretary
11 in its final form.

12 All of that needs to go through the
13 Government Printing Office requirement for printing
14 that type of thing. All of that is probably, you
15 know, at minimum a month process. So the plan would
16 be or the goal would be to have something to deliver
17 to her in its final form mid-September, present to her
18 hopefully with the signatures of those Commissioners
19 on the document, and present to her in mid-September
20 in its final form.

21 Any questions about that or --

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Okay. If we take action
24 in a prompt enough manner, we'll have plenty of time,
25 if people would like to, to discuss the -- some going-
26 forward ways we can help the process, help the

1 Secretary, help the country to take advantage of the
2 work we've done, so we'll have a chance to discuss
3 that today. But we'll have also a chance to continue
4 to do that, and we'd like your involvement.

5 I wrote a note to myself recently that we
6 reached a strong consensus of the Commission members,
7 and I probably should have said a consensus of the
8 strong Commission members.

9 (Laughter.)

10 COMMISSIONER HUNT: Maybe so, Mr.
11 Chairman.

12 CHAIRMAN MILLER: It's been hard work,
13 sometimes contentious, but from a diverse group of
14 people that's the way it ought to be. I think we have
15 come to some important conclusions, and I think people
16 can read this report in that way.

17 Governor Hunt is in North Carolina, and he
18 is prepared to make a motion.

19 COMMISSIONER HUNT: Mr. Chairman, I am
20 ready. I move for the adoption of the report of the
21 Secretary's Commission on the Future of Higher
22 Education, as represented in the current draft dated
23 8/9/06. I would assume, Mr. Chairman, that this
24 motion would allow for minor adjustments to be made
25 for better drafting, editing, and the inclusion of
26 visual tools to improve the presentation to the

1 public.

2 And, Mr. Chairman, if I may make just a
3 brief comment here, even before you entertain a
4 second. Let me say to my fellow Commission members
5 that I think this report will be one of the most
6 important reports in the education and economic
7 history of our country, if we act on it.

8 Our nation needs its higher education, and
9 we've constantly referred to this as America's higher
10 education. It doesn't belong just to colleges and
11 universities. It's our -- America higher education.
12 Our nation needs it to be better and to be more
13 accessible to all the people of America.

14 The economic competitiveness of our nation
15 requires it, and I think our moral obligation to equal
16 opportunity for all of our people demands it. I'm
17 hopeful that our effort on this Commission will result
18 in a national sense of urgency and a sustained
19 commitment to improve higher education similar to that
20 caused by A Nation at Risk over two decades ago.

21 Mr. Chairman, I was a Governor when that
22 Commission reported. In fact, I was the Chairman of
23 the Education Commission of the States. And within a
24 matter of months we had a very strong report come
25 forward to respond to that, and we've been seeing very
26 strong responses ever since.

1 In fact, I would say that for over two
2 decades now we've been responding to those very strong
3 proposals to improve K-12 education. And that has
4 happened in large measure because the people involved
5 in it then have pushed forth and we have continued to
6 go forward.

7 Chairman Miller, I want to commend you for
8 your leadership of this Commission. I was proud to be
9 a part of the work of this group, and I want to
10 commend all the members. And I want to strongly,
11 strongly urge, as I make this motion, that as we
12 consider this today -- and I hope all vote for it -- I
13 want to urge that we push forward to do the things
14 that are in this report.

15 I want to especially urge that all of the
16 organizations that represent higher education -- and
17 we've heard from many of them over these months, as we
18 should have -- I hope that all of them will help us
19 push forward. This will not be a time to nitpick and
20 to complain and to try to explain away some things.
21 This is going to be a time where we need to push
22 forward and to really make this work and change
23 America behind this report.

24 So I hope very much that it will be
25 considered favorably today, and that we will push
26 forward to make higher education in this nation all

1 that it can be, all that it should be, and all that it
2 must be.

3 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Governor.
4 Appreciate that -- your comments, and especially your
5 long-term leadership on all forms of education.

6 I'd like to recognize Dr. Arturo Madrid
7 for a second.

8 COMMISSIONER MADRID: Mr. Chairman, I'm
9 pleased to second Governor Hunt's motion, and with
10 your permission I'd like to add my remarks, too,
11 briefly.

12 I leave this undertaking with the same
13 concerns with which I entered it -- that our
14 institutions of higher education are principally
15 structured to do better by the best, and do very well
16 by them, but increasingly find themselves unable or
17 not disposed to do better by the rest.

18 Our findings indicate that these days we
19 are principally privileging the privileged, those of
20 us who by good -- by the good fortune of having been
21 born into stable, affluent, educated families, who
22 live in secure neighborhoods and attend schools of
23 reasonable size, whose teachers are well qualified and
24 adequately rewarded, who have reasonable access to
25 institutions of higher education, who by virtue of
26 those circumstances, the circumstances of birth and of

1 civic status, are able to have expectations that match
2 their aspirations.

3 All of us here had most of those
4 conditions, are present here by virtue of them. We
5 need to remind ourselves that a very large percentage
6 of our potential students do not.

7 We can argue about the specifics but not
8 about the consequences. The gap between those with
9 advantage and those with little or none is something
10 that is obvious. A healthy society rests on the well
11 being of all of its citizens. Its public and private
12 institutions must serve and serve well the interests
13 of all.

14 Not to hold this one extraordinary,
15 magnificent institution to this goal is to risk the
16 health of our society and its institutions. I urge
17 you to approve this report, whatever misgiving you
18 have with it, because it addresses that very
19 challenge, however imperfect.

20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Arturo.

22 I'm going to ask the members of the
23 Commission to talk about it in the room first, in
24 alphabetical order, and have a brief pause between
25 each member and statement, so that we give people on
26 the phone a chance to make a comment or intervene or

1 say something about their time.

2 Nick Donofrio.

3 COMMISSIONER DONOFRIO: Thank you, Mr.
4 Chairman, and Commissioners and colleagues. I'll be
5 very brief. What I'm about to say everybody already
6 knows. Education has been and will be the hope of the
7 future of our country. It's clearly that case for me.

8 Thinking, inventing, creating,
9 discovering, innovating, that's where the real value
10 is in the global economy that we participate in. This
11 report goes a tremendous distance in trying to move us
12 in that direction. I, too, urge my colleagues to
13 support this report no matter what their misgivings
14 are. In the final analysis, the greater good is
15 served.

16 In the final analysis, I remind you we
17 have aspired, we have clearly inspired, and now it is
18 time for us to perspire. The heavy work is clearly
19 ahead of us.

20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you very much.

22 Jonathan Grayer.

23 COMMISSIONER GRAYER: Thank you, Mr.
24 Chairman. I, too, will be brief. And like my
25 preceding speakers, I do not believe anything I'm
26 saying is not widely held around this room.

1 I will say that I support this final
2 document, because in large part I think it starts to
3 recognize that the future of our higher educational
4 system will be driven by its ability to serve those
5 that are coming into the system for the first time.
6 That if you look at our current institutions by
7 definition they will have very little growth.

8 They have very few -- little capacity to
9 serve more students. New students that are coming
10 either because of the echo boom that is driving
11 demographics throughout the country, or because
12 matriculation rates are happily going up, are going to
13 have to be served through alternative means of
14 education through online education, through community
15 colleges growing into bachelor programs, all kinds of
16 new ways of serving it.

17 I think that our report begins to address
18 that, and if it does address that Dr. Madrid's vision
19 of being able to serve the best to the rest will be a
20 goal we can achieve. So I heartily endorse what we've
21 done here and hope that, as Nick says, the work will
22 go ahead in making that true.

23 Thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Jonathan, for
25 your work.

26 Robert Mendenhall.

1 COMMISSIONER MENDENHALL: Thank you, Mr.
2 Chairman. Is that mike on? I want to start by
3 expressing appreciation to the Secretary and my
4 colleagues on the Commission for the opportunity to
5 have served. I, speaking personally, have enjoyed
6 immensely this opportunity and have learned a great
7 deal about the higher ed system in the United States.

8 And what I have learned has caused a
9 greater sense of urgency and concern that we address
10 in this report. But I think we found during the
11 course of our testimony significant facts. One that
12 the gaps between those who have access to higher
13 education and those who have limited access has
14 actually been increasing over the last 20 years as
15 opposed to decreasing, and we need to change policies
16 to close that gap.

17 Secondly, there are significant qualify
18 concerns with data such as the national assessment of
19 adult literacy and other data that suggest that we
20 need to increasingly focus on the effectiveness of the
21 education that we're delivering. And we've certainly
22 spent a lot of time on the affordability issues around
23 higher education.

24 I want to express my support for this
25 report, the findings and the recommendations, in
26 particular that we need to increase need-based aid,

1 that we need to focus on closing this gap, that we
2 need greater accountability and transparency for
3 results in the higher ed system.

4 And I think the report makes a strong
5 endorsement of reducing regulation and restrictions
6 that inhibit new models and new technologies and new
7 ways of delivering education, because fundamentally I
8 believe that technology and new models will enable us
9 in the next decade or two to educate far more
10 effectively and efficiently than we've been able to do
11 in the past.

12 And with that, I simply want to express
13 appreciation for the opportunity to get to know some
14 very smart people in this arena, to learn a lot about
15 higher education, and I pledge my support to helping
16 implement the recommendations that we've made as a
17 Commission.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Bob, very
20 much.

21 Dr. Charlene Nunley.

22 COMMISSIONER NUNLEY: Good morning. I,
23 too, want to thank the Secretary and my fellow
24 Commissioners, and also the Chair and the staff, who I
25 think have worked endless hours to try to bring us to
26 where we are today.

1 When I came on the Commission I came with
2 some goals, which I typically do in things that I
3 approach in life, and one of those goals was to try to
4 assure that this report had a powerful statement about
5 access, which I believe is the most crucial issue for
6 the future of our country.

7 And I'm very pleased to say that it does
8 that, and by "access" I don't mean just getting
9 students in the door. I mean broadening access to
10 historically under-represented populations and
11 progressing them through and out the door, which I
12 think we still have some very significant challenges
13 to face in higher education.

14 I think the report is very strong on
15 access with its need-based aid components and its call
16 for partnering between colleges and high schools to
17 try to assure that students enter college better
18 prepared. A second goal was to try to assure that
19 issues important to community colleges and their
20 students were well represented in this report.

21 Too often, although we serve nearly half
22 of the undergraduate students in the nation, we are
23 the afterthought when people converse about higher
24 education. And we are front and center in the issues
25 that this report addresses. And so I want to thank my
26 colleagues on the Commission for working to assure

1 that issues important to America's community colleges
2 and their needs are well represented in this report.

3 Finally, I wanted to make sure that we
4 created a report that did something good for the
5 students who are enrolling in higher education. I
6 listened to the powerful testimony by the students who
7 are taking on these incredible loan burdens that are
8 compromising their capability to even pursue the
9 careers that they would most like to pursue, and where
10 we need them to work in this economy.

11 I am very pleased that this report calls
12 for a substantial increase in need-based aid, and for
13 a dramatic simplification of the federal financial aid
14 process, which again I think is very, very important
15 to these historically under-represented populations
16 that must come into our institutions.

17 Finally, I'm glad because community
18 colleges are very front and center in issues of
19 workforce preparation, that this report has strong
20 recommendations on adult and workforce preparation,
21 which I think we again don't focus on enough when we
22 speak about higher education.

23 I am pleased to have been a part of this
24 process, and I, too, pledge my commitment to doing all
25 that I can to help the recommendations in this report
26 to be advanced in higher education.

1 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you very much,
2 Charlene.

3 Catherine Reynolds.

4 COMMISSIONER REYNOLDS: I, too, would like
5 to thank the Secretary, my fellow Commissioners, the
6 staff, and, of course, our Chairman, Charles Miller.
7 I believe this is a very powerful initiative to help
8 create an educated citizenry. And I think the report
9 reflects strong statements about access and about the
10 need to give more funding to the needy, which I
11 support very strongly.

12 And while there has been a lot of
13 discussion about the cost of higher education, I still
14 believe that it is the best investment we can make as
15 a country and by individuals. So with that, I pledge
16 my support for this report.

17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Catherine.

19 Sara Martinez Tucker.

20 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Thank you, Mr.
21 Chairman. I'm going to start with the staff, because
22 I think the staff did a tremendous job in enabling a
23 lot of our contentious debate and bringing us
24 together. Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and thank you to
25 my fellow Commissioners.

26 I'm reminded that high school -- that

1 college graduations, many of the commencement speakers
2 often exhort the graduates that it isn't the ending
3 but it's the beginning. And I think in a sense that
4 that's the same -- true for us.

5 This report makes six strong statements.
6 The first is that we want every American child to
7 graduate high school ready for post-secondary
8 education. The second is that we want to make sure
9 that these students are able to afford education both
10 by having more resources, and, second, by keeping the
11 cost of education affordable for Americans.

12 We're asking our colleges and universities
13 to ensure that the product that they sell to the
14 students is indeed a good product, and that they
15 continue to innovate to ensure that that statement is
16 true for future generations.

17 We're asking for an increased focus in
18 fields that are important for our global
19 competitiveness. And, lastly, we're asking us all to
20 become lifelong learners.

21 But as we make our recommendations and
22 gather today to endorse these six strong statements, I
23 want to encourage us to remember that this national
24 dialogue that we've had thus far to get us to this
25 point is only the beginning.

26 As several others have said, the devil is

1 in the details, and if we don't enable or facilitate
2 the better alignment between high school standards and
3 college admission, if we don't restructure financial
4 aid to get more resources to the needy, if we don't
5 continuously innovate and keep college affordable,
6 then we will have failed as a Commission. And so my
7 hope would be that this dialogue that we've started is
8 a dialogue that my Commissioners and I will continue
9 to have with the Secretary to ensure that we implement
10 these proposals for the good of our country and for
11 the good of our students.

12 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Sara, very
13 much. I'm reminded that I didn't identify everyone
14 that was on the phone. Governor Hunt talked, but Dr.
15 Duderstadt is on the phone, Arthur Rothkopf, Richard
16 Stephens, Louis Sullivan, and Robert Zemsky, members
17 of the Commission. So I apologize for that, not
18 saying that earlier. I just made the statement they
19 were there without identifying them.

20 I know Dr. Zemsky has in his DNA that he's
21 going to be last everywhere, so I hope he doesn't mind
22 being in that position now. But next on our list
23 would be Dr. Richard Vedder.

24 COMMISSIONER VEDDER: Thank you, Mr.
25 Chairman. Continuing this higher education love
26 fest --

1 (Laughter.)

2 -- I am certainly proud to be a part of --
3 I want to not only echo what people have said about
4 thanking Secretary Spellings, Chairman Miller, and the
5 staff, but I think we ought to at least mention the
6 names of a few of the staff people. And I'm not --
7 there's Cheryl Oldham over here, who is the Staff
8 Director, Vicky Schray, Eleanor Schiff, and Kristen
9 Vetri, among others, and I'm sure the Chairman will
10 fill in more at the end. But they've been most
11 helpful in this.

12 Now, my take on this is a little different
13 than some of the others, but it comes to the same
14 conclusion. For me it was a tough decision to decide
15 how to vote on this report. But the bottom line is
16 that the report's recommendations, if adopted, will
17 improve higher education in the United States and will
18 improve the quality of life for the American people.
19 That's an important bottom line.

20 However, let me mention in passing some of
21 my concerns, and not out of criticism of what we've
22 done, about what we perhaps didn't do. My concerns
23 are more -- about more of errors of omission than
24 commission. No pun intended.

25 The report says virtually nothing about
26 the more than \$80 billion student loan industry, and

1 the small effort that the chair made to say something
2 about that was removed because of a good deal of
3 protest, which to me is perhaps a bad omen for the
4 future of the recommendations of the Commission.

5 We do not speak about the deplorable lack
6 of intellectual diversity and the stifling of freedom
7 of expression on some campuses. We say nothing about
8 the hedonistic culture and the lack of high
9 performance expectations at some universities, as is
10 symbolized by such phenomena as grade inflation.

11 We do not speak of concerns raised by
12 Harry Lewis and others about the indifference of
13 faculty at some campuses about the broader moral,
14 cultural, and civic development of young adults. We
15 say nothing about the lack of coherence in our
16 curriculum. And perhaps we overly stress in this
17 report the vocational dimensions of higher education
18 relative to other objectives such as the furtherance
19 of the advancement of western civilization in its
20 broadest dimensions.

21 We do not say enough about research -- a
22 point made by some other university people. And with
23 respect to research, we say nothing about the
24 deplorable current tendency of politicians -- and I
25 will name names, members of -- well, I won't name
26 names, there's too many of them --

1 (Laughter.)

2 -- members of Congress to politically
3 interfere in the rational allocation of research
4 resources. Yet having said all this, I think we say a
5 lot of useful things in this report. As others have
6 mentioned, coming -- being the victim of alphabetic
7 discrimination, although not as much as Mr. Zemsky and
8 Mr. Ward and Mr. Vest, I -- nearly everything has been
9 said.

10 But this report does move to make colleges
11 more efficient, more affordable. We aim to help lower
12 income and disadvantaged persons of all ages,
13 including adults, enter college. And above all, we
14 advocate greater transparency and measurement of
15 outcomes, which I think in and of itself, is an
16 innovation of potentially transcendental importance if
17 it is adopted.

18 Therefore, I, too, will sign the report.

19 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Rich.

20 Dr. Charles Vest.

21 COMMISSIONER VEST: Mr. Chairman, I agree
22 with what my colleague Rich Vedder has said in the
23 sense that this report does not address everything
24 about higher education that could be, and perhaps even
25 should be, addressed. But I think it addresses some
26 very important issues, and I certainly intend to vote

1 favorably on Governor Hunt's motion to adopt this
2 report.

3 I wanted to say very briefly that there
4 were two things that I valued above all else, both in
5 service on this Commission and in terms of the report
6 that we have drafted. The first is that this
7 Commission represents the huge breadth of post-
8 secondary education in the United States.

9 We all know a lot about research
10 universities and colleges, but it was very important
11 that at the table we had people engaged in distance
12 learning, community colleges, for profit as well as
13 not for profit, and I hope that this is the beginning
14 of a broader and more continuous dialogue among these
15 groups, and that we come to think of ourselves more as
16 a system, not something that is mandated or oppressive
17 but that through working together we come to think
18 about the entire breadth of post-secondary education.

19 I value that.

20 Secondly, I am extremely grateful to my
21 fellow Commissioners and our Chairman and everyone
22 else involved that this report has very
23 straightforward language about the importance in this
24 country of racial diversity and economic diversity and
25 the lack of access and opportunity that some groups
26 feel much more strongly than others.

1 And as I said at one of our earlier
2 meetings, I believe that the most important thing the
3 Commission could do was to make a bold and meaningful
4 statement and proposal about reforming our financial
5 aid system and investing more in need-based grant aid
6 for our students. And I'm grateful that the group did
7 just that.

8 I also want to comment very quickly on
9 three other things. One is that as Rich has said, we
10 do pay a lot of attention to what the country has to
11 do in terms of generating knowledge and knowledgeable
12 citizens to be competitive, and I would like to always
13 emphasize and to lead in the complicated global
14 economy in which our new generation lives and works.

15 We recognize excellence up front. We
16 almost take it for granted. But we recognize -- I
17 would like to emphasize today that this is not about
18 excellence in education just for its own sake. It is
19 about sustaining and enhancing the excellence of our
20 total post-secondary education system to produce
21 knowledge and to produce an educational capacity for
22 our nation and, indeed, for the world.

23 I believe -- and these are my words, not
24 the report's -- that I read this report as calling for
25 three things -- innovation, reform, and investment.
26 It calls for creating an infrastructure and an

1 environment in which innovation, reform, and
2 investment can take place.

3 The report emphasizes the first two more
4 than the third, although the investment is in there,
5 and the call for investment in financial aid, the call
6 for investment in research, and I believe that we have
7 stressed the need for innovation and reform in higher
8 education because it is through those two things that
9 we will earn the investments on the part of our
10 federal governments, our state governments, and our
11 private donors that will enable us to provide
12 excellence, access, and opportunity to our citizens.

13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Chuck, very,
15 very much.

16 Dr. David Ward.

17 COMMISSIONER WARD: I guess I may be
18 providing the rain on this unanimous reaction to the
19 report. I do share with everybody a very positive
20 reaction to the report, but that in its entirety I
21 feel reluctant to sign it. Let me say a little bit,
22 and also mention in the beginning that the concerns
23 that I have had and have been expressed have been
24 received courteously and with frankness.

25 And I do appreciate, the chair and I have
26 had many dialogues over differences and similarities

1 amongst us and the staff work. So as somebody who has
2 some apprehension about some of the material, I still
3 feel strongly that the process gave a voice of
4 moderate dissonance, certainly its place and respect.

5 We have clearly defined key issues.

6 The --

7 COMMISSIONER DUDERSTADT: Could I ask if
8 you could get closer to the microphone and speak up?
9 It's a little hard to hear.

10 COMMISSIONER WARD: That we have certainly
11 defined the key issues. I'm almost entirely
12 supportive of the material on access, and I think in
13 other areas much of it I find important, particularly
14 the idea of transparent accountability.

15 Where I think I have apprehension is that
16 I wish that we could have built our arguments more on
17 the strength of higher education than on the idea that
18 there may be a crisis or even an emerging crisis. I
19 know this is a bit of a tightrope, but I would wish
20 that we could have said a little more about best
21 practices and how best practices that are currently
22 occurring in a very hopeful way could have been scaled
23 up, so that in a sense we're not moving from a base of
24 nothing but from a base of strength.

25 My second issue is, and it has already
26 been mentioned by Chuck, and I think by Jonathan,

1 higher education -- and certainly the membership of my
2 association -- is very varied, whether we think of
3 community colleges, preparatory schools, distance
4 education, major research universities.

5 And there is a tendency as one sizes up
6 problems and tries to generalize about those problems.

7 The solutions and the analysis has a sort of one size
8 fits all to it. I think we've avoided that overtly,
9 but I think as we move forward the sense that one size
10 fits all, whether it be accountability or how you
11 manage financial aid, is something that I would just
12 provide a caution about.

13 The third observation I would make -- and
14 it comes back to Chuck Vest's comments about
15 innovation, access, and investment -- even if we
16 achieve our goals of cost containment and more
17 effective institutions, even if we have transparent
18 accountability that makes visible the limitations and
19 strengths of higher education, there will still in my
20 view be an enormous fiscal challenge of creating the
21 investment resources to create the need-based grants
22 that sustain our democracy.

23 I think we have not quite got our arms
24 around the sheer challenge of combining high access
25 and high quality, and what the balance between
26 individual responsibility, the state responsibility,

1 and the university's responsibility may be. It's a
2 three-legged stool, and how those proportions are
3 assigned I think in this report there is a slight
4 tendency, and I'd just say a slight tendency, to
5 attribute some problems almost entirely to higher
6 education when there are multiple factors involved in
7 creating those problems.

8 Finally, let me say that I valued and
9 learned a great deal from this Commission, and it is,
10 I think, the beginning of a dialogue, not the end of a
11 dialogue. I think I personally, because of the role I
12 play, can be more effective if I am free to contest
13 not many but some pretty critical aspects of this
14 report as we move forward.

15 So it is in sharing with many of the
16 members of this Commission the very positive, forceful
17 demand for change and reform, but that I have some
18 apprehension about some of the details and some of the
19 implications of the solutions as we look at both the
20 fiscal realities and the sheer diversity and magnitude
21 of higher education.

22 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, David.

24 Dr. Duderstadt. James Duderstadt.

25 COMMISSIONER DUDERSTADT: Yes, thank you,
26 Mr. Chairman.

1 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER DUDERSTADT: I'd like to join
3 with others in commending the members of the
4 Commission for the dedication and the wisdom they have
5 devoted over the past several months to this task. As
6 Chuck has mentioned, I think one of the very strengths
7 of the Commission was its diversity, and it also made
8 the task of converging on chief recommendations and
9 drafting the report a considerable challenge.

10 And in this regard, I really must commend
11 the chair and the staff of the Commission for not only
12 their responsiveness to our many suggestions and
13 concerns, but their skill in weaving together this
14 dialogue through a process that has allowed us to
15 arrive together at a series of recommendations that
16 are both powerful and extremely important to the
17 future of higher education and its capacity to serve
18 the nation.

19 In running through this very quickly, at
20 the 100,000-foot level, removing the barriers to
21 enable access to the success in higher education for
22 all Americans, restructuring financial aid, calling
23 for the transparency, accountability, and commitment
24 to public purpose, that I think we believe is
25 necessary to earn public trust and confidence,
26 investing in innovation, calling for commitment to

1 lifelong learning, and responding to the unfairness of
2 a global knowledge economy. These are very strong
3 recommendations of immense importance.

4 Like others on the Commission has
5 mentioned thus far, there are details in the report
6 that, like many of you, I would frame somewhat
7 differently. But I think the recommendations are so
8 compelling, and the report more generally is so
9 important that it's deserving of our strong support
10 and it certainly will have mine.

11 And I really agree with Governor Hunt that
12 our attention must now turn to how each of us can lend
13 our support to the task of making these
14 recommendations a reality. There's going to be a lot
15 of heavy lifting in the months and years ahead to
16 bring these recommendations into action, and that's
17 how I think we can best serve the nation.

18 Thank you very much.

19 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Jim.

20 Governor Hunt, I was going to skip you
21 this round. Are you there still, sir?

22 COMMISSIONER HUNT: I'm here, yes, sir.

23 CHAIRMAN MILLER: And come back toward the
24 conclusion, so if you have something more to add after
25 this for your motion.

26 Arthur Rothkopf.

1 COMMISSIONER ROTHKOPF: Yes, thank you,
2 Charles. I would like to particularly commend the
3 Chairman and the staff, as others have said, for
4 pursuing and developing a process that I think has
5 brought together a group that started in very
6 different places. There were skeptics out there,
7 including members of the press who said this
8 Commission couldn't get together on recommendations,
9 couldn't agree on things.

10 And as the process developed under your
11 leadership, Mr. Chairman, we, I think, have gotten to
12 a place where I think the vast majority of us feel
13 very, very comfortable where we are. There are things
14 that are not said. There are recommendations some of
15 us might have liked that are not in this report. But
16 we have a report that hits the high points, and in
17 many ways it is right that we be looking at a limited
18 number of very significant recommendations on the
19 very, very key issues that are here.

20 And let me just make a point about the
21 process, and that is over the past several months
22 there has been a national dialogue. All these groups
23 that have come before us in person or in writing who
24 have presented their views, not only have those views
25 impacted those of us on the Commission, but I also
26 believe that we're starting to see some movement in

1 higher education.

2 I would particularly commend the land
3 grant institutions under the leadership of Peter
4 McPherson, beginning to look at opportunities for
5 outcome assessment and more transparency. Similarly,
6 the AAU group, which has come forward, and begun to
7 look at options. That is happening because this
8 Commission has been in existence, and because of what
9 we've talked about and the issues of assessment and
10 accountability.

11 And I think what is happening is that at
12 least parts of higher education are beginning to focus
13 on the problems and begin to focus on solutions. I
14 think there are a couple of areas where I think we
15 have done exceptionally well. I think the issue of
16 access is number one and probably number for all of us
17 when we met and put our preferences on board.

18 And I think the focus needs to be on need-
19 based aid, and another of those is that we can't
20 change the system. And some of these programs are out
21 there, and they're in the law, or they're in practice.

22 I think we have to look at where financial aid, where
23 tax credits are, where private institutions are giving
24 so-called merit aid.

25 All that merit aid is taking money away
26 from those who need the money the most, and I would

1 urge that those institutions and those government
2 agencies that are funding merit aid ought to look as
3 to whether that's the right thing to be doing. And I
4 think we have put that issue on the table.

5 Overall, I think we have come up with a
6 very powerful report, a report that I think will serve
7 the country well, and will move us in the direction of
8 having -- being able to meet our competitive needs.

9 And let me just conclude with a plea to
10 the private institutions out there. I was, I think
11 most of you know, president of a private institution
12 for 12 years, very active at both the state and
13 federal level in the associations, in the independent
14 sector. And I'd have to say -- and I've said this to
15 the president, that I -- I've said it privately, and
16 I'll say it publicly, I think there has not been a
17 sufficiently positive response to try and deal with
18 the issue, that the process may be beginning.

19 So I think the private sector, which is
20 affected very much by these issues of transparency and
21 accountability, need to take a hard look at what we're
22 recommending and not just as a reflex say no. I think
23 it's important for the private sector to be open, and
24 I want to urge the presidents of private institutions
25 to read this report and see what it actually says and
26 recommends before taking an approach of, gee, this

1 can't be done.

2 We I think have done a remarkably good job
3 of putting these important issues on the table. I
4 think we've got a series of good recommendations. We
5 want to deal with people as we go forward, and I'm
6 committed to do whatever I can to help implement what
7 I think is a remarkable document.

8 So, again, thank you to the Chairman,
9 thank you to the staff, and to my fellow
10 Commissioners.

11 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Art.

12 Ricky Stephens.

13 COMMISSIONER STEPHENS: Mr. Chairman,
14 thanks very much. I, too, would like to echo the
15 thoughts that many already have about, you know,
16 thanking the Secretary, certainly not least the staff,
17 and fellow Commissioners, and you, Charles, for
18 herding us as we've gone through this process.

19 I've learned much over the last year from
20 a -- what I consider a diverse group of fellow
21 Commissioners. We have worked hard to understand our
22 respective positions, and I think it has been very
23 important that we've been able to align around a set
24 of common values and expectations of higher education.

25 I think page 3 of the report delineates
26 those in those five bullet points that are in the

1 middle of the page. And I think that unto itself is
2 extremely important, because any time we're trying to
3 talk about the level of change that we've discussed,
4 particularly in the areas of access, cost,
5 affordability, financial aid, learning,
6 accountability, and as was just mentioned the
7 significant importance about transparency, so long as
8 we have a set of expectations we can rally around we
9 may differ in how to implement those expectations, but
10 the focus for our success will in fact be around
11 making sure we're all aligned to state that's the
12 direction that we're going.

13 I think going forward we have much to do,
14 as a nation, to begin alignment, and there are a
15 number of us now prepared to help support that. But
16 as was pointed out earlier on by many, we have some
17 heavy lifting yet to do, and our work has just begun.

18 You have my commitment to help support
19 implementation and continue the debate to get
20 alignment about how we press forward, and I will
21 enthusiastically sign the report.

22 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Rick.

23 Dr. Sullivan, Louis Sullivan. May have
24 lost him. That's a shame. Dr. Sullivan?

25 (No response.)

26 Dr. Zemsky, you may have the honor of not

1 being last. Would you try to speak up? Dr. Robert
2 Zemsky.

3 COMMISSIONER ZEMSKY: Charles, I don't
4 know who is going to be most uncomfortable about the
5 fact that I have near the last word on this, you or
6 me.

7 (Laughter.)

8 CHAIRMAN MILLER: I'll do it either way
9 you want, Dr. Zemsky.

10 (Laughter.)

11 I would not be me if I did not say I was
12 uncomfortable, if I did not say that I share some of
13 David Ward's real interest. I pleaded, as you all
14 know, that we ought to be long on recommendations,
15 which as everybody has said are powerful, purposeful,
16 and to the point, and short on surrounding noise.

17 And I think we're still too long on
18 surrounding noise, and I think, Cheryl, when you talk
19 about copy editing, I hope there really is a very
20 strong copy-editing job done on this document.

21 And I really want to talk about things
22 that Nick and Sara and Art said about going forward.
23 And I think it's terribly important that we not only
24 strap on our armor but we sort of understand the
25 desert we're about to try to go off.

26 I don't know how many of you have been

1 reading all of your e-mails or whether I'm the only
2 one that gets all these e-mails, but I have been
3 really disheartened by the number of e-mails I have
4 gotten from people who I think would naturally support
5 our recommendations, and who have, for a variety of
6 reasons, became extraordinarily hostile to our
7 efforts.

8 The point is, as Art points out, they have
9 stopped reading what we are writing. I think that --
10 going forward in a way begins today, but we still
11 suffer from what happened three months ago. And why
12 we would all like to pretend it didn't happen, and
13 that we came through the travail and we're all one,
14 there are a lot of people out there who no longer
15 believe in us. So that when we say we have heavy
16 lifting to go forward, we are doing the heavy lifting.
17 We have trust rebuilding.

18 I would remind my fellow Commissioners
19 that higher education is a particular kind of
20 enterprise where the easiest thing to do is to do
21 nothing. And our whole thrust is to say you can no
22 longer do nothing, you must do something.

23 More than that, you must do something
24 purposeful and for the good of the nation, because you
25 don't get people up and moving in your revolution by
26 first telling them that they are on the wrong side --

1 David's right. We need to be sure that as we go
2 forward we talk about building on strength and not
3 building on weakness.

4 But the recommendations are strong, and I
5 support them, and I will sign the document.

6 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you very much,
7 Rob.

8 Check one more time. Dr. Sullivan?

9 (No response.)

10 He has expressed support for the report; I
11 am at liberty to say that. The two missing members --
12 Kati Haycock and Gerri Elliott -- said the same thing.
13 So I'll just add that to the conversation.

14 Governor Hunt.

15 COMMISSIONER HUNT: Mr. Chairman, I have
16 appreciated all of these comments. And I don't know
17 exactly what you anticipate us doing after you go
18 around, but I do want to say this. It's time to work.

19 As soon as this report is approved today, I hope that
20 the Secretary, whose idea this was and who has given
21 us wonderful leadership, that the President elected by
22 America and whom the Secretary serves, you as our
23 Chairman, and all of us as members of this Commission,
24 will get ready to go forward with a specific plan to
25 implement the proposal to this report.

26 I think that should be seen in proposals

1 by the President. I would hope that all of these
2 major recommendations in our report would be reflected
3 in proposals by the President to the Congress. I hope
4 that the Secretary will very actively work for those,
5 lobby those, testify to the Congress, and that you,
6 Mr. Chairman, would do the same thing.

7 I would hope that we would also focus on
8 the states. At one point, talking to President
9 Nunley, she made the point that we can't let the
10 states off the hook, and that is exactly right. The
11 state should feel the urgency to -- in their own way
12 to pursue these recommendations, and to put more
13 resources into higher education. As has happened with
14 the K-12 education, we need to have the governors very
15 actively involved in this.

16 We need to have the business community
17 pushing forward and very strongly for these changes.
18 And we need to have the education leaders themselves,
19 in particular all of the organizations there in
20 Washington, D.C., who -- where they have their
21 headquarters there, at least most of them, working
22 very actively to make this come about.

23 So it's going to take very hard work, and
24 this nation can do it. We've seen it happen before.
25 It can happen again, but that's what's going to be
26 required now. And I would hope very much as we vote

1 for this today, and we discuss it in all kinds of
2 venues around America, that our elected leaders in
3 particular to allow -- get ready to go forward and
4 make this a very strong subject of America's
5 discussion over the next years to come.

6 I would hope it would be discussed in
7 political campaigns at all levels, that all of us
8 would work together to make the very strong and
9 powerful changes in higher education and our nation's
10 commitment to it that's going to be required.

11 So, Mr. Chairman, I'm delighted to hear
12 that -- the comments about this, the commitment to it
13 that we heard in this discussion today, and I hope
14 very much that you will spend the next several years,
15 and the Secretary will, pushing forward on this just
16 as you have done in leading what I think is the very
17 fine work of this Commission.

18 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Governor.
19 I'm going to take that as a call for action. And if
20 you would let me -- I think the Chairman is not
21 supposed to technically talk about a motion, but
22 rather than say something after the vote, just some
23 comments in a general sense about the report.

24 I think there are some unique things about
25 this report relative to higher education that are
26 important. It's been covered by several people

1 already. Innovation and the focus on that is very
2 important. For all of us in all parts of society that
3 is important, and that was brought out by a major
4 study from the Council on Competitiveness that we talk
5 about by reference as we did The Gathering Storm and
6 the President's American Competitiveness Initiative.

7 That's a harder thing to do than to say --
8 and an institution which is proud to have stayed and
9 been the fine institution it has been, higher
10 education and to some extent protects its form, that's
11 a harder thing to accept sometime, and I think that's
12 a message -- that it's different in this report.

13 I think what's different is we focused on
14 lifelong learning, the non-traditional students, and
15 what we're going to see in the future, 70 percent or
16 more of the students, so that instead of segmenting
17 higher education, which is the tendency of the task
18 force, the Commission, and looking at the way we're
19 structured today, even with the diversity among those,
20 and getting locked into the present as opposed to
21 thinking of the future, we talk more about lifelong
22 learning and the flexibility and responsiveness of
23 that part of the system. And that is a very, very
24 different approach.

25 I think that wouldn't have been the
26 typical result of people from higher education only

1 that it helped -- we had the innovative people from
2 higher education and people from other points of view.

3 I think several of you have said this, but I think
4 transparency and outcomes accountability is different
5 in this report, and that the Academy heard that early
6 on and it acted very responsibly.

7 And I'm proud to say that AASCU and
8 NASULGC and others have been receptive to that and are
9 way ahead of where anybody would have thought they
10 would have been a year from now. And I think that's
11 the way it should be, that the higher ed systems heard
12 that and have responded. And transparency breeds
13 trust.

14 It's maybe the most important thing of all
15 that we could say, and with that trust and innovation
16 and reform, as Chuck Vest said, you get the
17 investment. I think those are the orders in which you
18 ask for funds, and we should make significant
19 investments in higher education at every level and
20 every place, including from the private sector.

21 I think the financial things that we said
22 in the report are also unique that wouldn't have been
23 in other kinds of reports. So I think when we look
24 back at it they are futuristic-type focuses, they are
25 not narrow, they aren't historically the way we did
26 it, so in those new ways of looking at things I think

1 we've accomplished something that would be beneficial
2 for the future, for higher education and public
3 education and for the country.

4 So I thank you very much for your service.

5 I'd like to call for a vote signified by saying aye.

6 (Chorus of ayes.)

7 Opposed?

8 COMMISSIONER WARD: Mr. Chairman, I'd like
9 the record to reflect that I will not be signing the
10 report.

11 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you very much.
12 We'll record it that way. I'm going to assume that
13 everyone else recorded affirmatively, and including
14 the two people that are not here to voice that but
15 gave me authority to do that.

16 Can't thank you enough for getting to this
17 place efficiently with the most difficult -- hard work
18 in process I've ever seen. I'd like to use this
19 opportunity to do what some of you said, but also feel
20 free to -- if you need to get up and move around or
21 catch an airplane or get started, feel free to do
22 that.

23 What about suggestions for how to go
24 forward? What -- excuse me, David.

25 MR. DUNN: I'm sorry, Mr. Chairman. But
26 if I might, and it's appropriate, just --

1 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Please.

2 MR. DUNN: -- express -- the Secretary
3 asked me to express her thanks for, again, all of the
4 hard work that -- from all of the Commissioners and
5 the staff, everybody involved with this report. She
6 -- I think her primary objective in naming this
7 Commission a year ago is embedded in the title of the
8 report, and that is a national dialogue around higher
9 education.

10 And as many of the Commissioners have
11 commented in the remarks, she clearly believes that --
12 that dialogue has started. But also echoing what many
13 of the Commissioners have said, we certainly shouldn't
14 view this as the conclusion of that dialogue. And she
15 is very much committed going forward to keeping that
16 dialogue alive.

17 She is looking forward to reviewing and
18 will commend to folks in the Department to do a
19 thorough review of the recommendations. And I'm sure
20 you'll be hearing words from her in terms of
21 implementation in the not-too-distant future.

22 So, but I just wanted to take the
23 opportunity to relay the Secretary's gratitude for all
24 the hard work from each and every one of you.

25 Thanks.

26 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, David, very

1 much.

2 COMMISSIONER SULLIVAN: Mr. Chairman?

3 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Yes. Dr. Sullivan,
4 welcome.

5 COMMISSIONER SULLIVAN: All right. Well,
6 thanks very much. I was on at the beginning, but
7 because I'm trying to do too many things, with
8 apologies I had signed off. But I did want to call
9 back to express to you and the members of the
10 Commission and you, Mr. Chairman, my gratitude for
11 your leadership and the great support.

12 And, secondly, to state that I fully
13 support the report as it has been developed. And as
14 you know, one of my concerns has been points of access
15 to educational opportunities for the nation's poor and
16 minorities, and I do believe the report addresses that
17 in sufficient detail and commitment. So I feel very
18 good about what has been developed there.

19 And my second concern has been, of course,
20 the whole issue of access to graduate and professional
21 education, but recognizing that the Commission is
22 focused primarily on undergraduate education. I know
23 that the focus of this report is appropriate, but I
24 would hope that -- and I think as Jim Duderstadt has
25 also suggested, that somewhere in the preamble there
26 be a reference to the need for also having some

1 actions and some observations of the need for changes
2 in graduate and professional education.

3 So that was my one other comment. That in
4 no way detracts from my support of the report as it
5 has been developed.

6 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you, Dr. Sullivan.

7 We heard those comments, and we'll find a way to add
8 that in the material.

9 COMMISSIONER ROTHKOPF: Mr. Chairman, it's
10 Arthur Rothkopf. Just on your question of
11 implementation, let me suggest this. I'm certainly
12 more than willing to do it, and I'm sure other
13 Commissioners will as well, to the extent that these
14 issues come before the Congress, I think it would be
15 important that, of course, the Secretary be there to
16 promote that, but that also members of the Commission
17 make themselves available for any such appearances.

18 In addition, as higher education groups
19 and other groups meet on the report, and we all --
20 some of us may not know about those meetings, I would
21 really urge that the Department ask individual
22 Commissioners or maybe groups of us to go before these
23 organizations and explain our recommendations, and
24 seek to persuade those who may be skeptics or may not
25 quite understand what we're doing, or what we have
26 done, to support these recommendations.

CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you. Just as a matter of equity and friendship, I would just ask Dr. Zemsky to see if he would have a comment on that going forward, start at the end of the alphabet. Dr. Zemsky.

I think what Art has said is right, that the report will have saliency provided it comes to the higher education community from our guide. I don't just mean those of us at universities. I think some of the things that Nick has said over and over again, and Rick Stephens has said over and over again, need to be heard in higher education.

What's an interesting thought, and would

1 make me much more comfortable actually, is get the
2 report but sort of set forth through a group of
3 messengers rather than believing a report like A
4 Nation at Risk was going to be the catalyst.

5 I think if this is going to work, we as
6 individuals have to be the catalyst, and I think that
7 actually has real promise for the future.

8 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you.

9 Dr. Vest.

10 COMMISSIONER VEST: Mr. Chairman, I, too,
11 will stick my neck out. I'd like to suggest four
12 near-term things that need to be done in my view as we
13 in the Department of Education, the administration,
14 leave the starting blocks.

15 One, I want to second something you said
16 earlier, and I see my colleague Peter McPherson here.

17 I think one of the most important things is for
18 NASULGC to continue its good work and propagate it
19 across the higher ed community and advertise what has
20 come from within, from our faculties, from our
21 administration, inside out, from bottom up, to address
22 some of the issues of transparency and accountability,
23 and so forth.

24 Second, no matter how we look at it,
25 Secretary Spellings will be faced with a large menu of
26 possible things to drive and prioritize. And I would

1 urge her to first and foremost pick up our
2 recommendations regarding restructuring and
3 reinvesting in need-based financial aid, and work
4 through the administration to put a serious
5 legislative package together. That would be
6 personally my first priority.

7 Third, because things are happening even
8 as we sit here, there is very important innovation
9 legislation in the Congress right now that reflects
10 the work you, Mr. Chairman, referred to earlier -- the
11 President's American competitiveness issue, the
12 Council on Competitiveness' national innovation
13 initiative, and the National Academy's Gathering Storm
14 report.

15 I would urge all of us from business,
16 higher education, the administration, and the
17 Congress, to move aggressively as soon as folks are
18 reconvened at the end of the summer to move that
19 legislation forward. Among other things, that will
20 assure some of our critics who do not recognize that
21 we do realize the excellence and importance of our
22 research universities and of innovation for the
23 nation's competitive future.

24 And, finally, within the higher education
25 community, I would pick up on something that was said
26 a little bit ago -- and, David, I believe it was you,

1 I'm not sure. The simplest thing we can do is start
2 sharing best practices. There is a lot of good
3 thinking, good change, good innovation out there in
4 our colleges and universities, and I think we in the
5 community simply need to take it upon ourselves to
6 advertise that, to share it, to promulgate it, and
7 that's the fastest way forward.

8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Excuse me. On the
10 latter, we talked about including that in part of the
11 report.

12 MS. OLDHAM: We did. Initially, we had
13 some sort of models, best practices that we sent
14 around to everybody that was included in the initial
15 draft, sort of sidebars to be included in the report,
16 and that was our sort of plan as we go forward with
17 the layout, to highlight various models in the report.

18 CHAIRMAN MILLER: And to add to that over
19 time, and my recommendation and advice would be for
20 the Secretary to find as many of those as we can, and
21 -- excuse me for this informality -- reach out and put
22 our arms around them. In other words, to really
23 highlight those from her bully pulpit or whatever.
24 That would be one of the pieces of advice. And so
25 could any of the members here, that we should
26 highlight those really innovative ideas.

1 COMMISSIONER HUNT: Mr. Chairman, this is
2 Jim Hunt again. There have been a lot of good
3 comments about the work of the staff, and they've done
4 an excellent job. I would hope very much that the
5 Secretary would ask the staff, or at least a good
6 number of them, to continue to work on this just as
7 they have, as we have developed this report, to
8 continue to focus on implementing these proposals, you
9 know, for the years to come.

10 If this wonderful staff has to now turn to
11 other things and get their mind off this ball, we're
12 not going to bring about the changes that we're
13 proposing here and that America needs. So I would
14 hope very much that she, with your encouragement and
15 your leadership, would continue to have a large part
16 of this staff to put this now on implementation and
17 work on it every single day.

18 CHAIRMAN MILLER: I don't want to speak
19 for the Secretary, but I -- I agree with what you
20 said. I think what I could say is I think she is
21 prepared to put her efforts into this issue, that she
22 has heard the national dialogue, she is going to study
23 the report, there will be some statements about what
24 her plans would be in both the near future, and I
25 expect when we present the report to her formally,
26 which probably is mid-September, we'll begin to hear

1 from her and from the Department about specific plans.

2 So I think this is just -- this isn't the
3 finality of the Commission. In the technical sense,
4 we do this formality in mid-September, and I think at
5 that time she would have studied and been able to
6 respond more definitively.

7 COMMISSIONER HUNT: And I would hope that
8 she would call us, the staff would suggest places that
9 different members of the Commission might go to speak
10 to be a part of a panel. But different ways that we
11 can move forward and talk to the people and encourage
12 action that's going to be necessary.

13 CHAIRMAN MILLER: I'm sure she would be
14 responsive to that very much.

15 COMMISSIONER ROTHKOPF: Mr. Chairman,
16 those are great statements. I think along those
17 lines, I think that it would in fact be helpful that
18 after the report is presented to the Secretary if she
19 can give us some guidance about her expectations of
20 us. As I think we've all talked about, you know, many
21 of us, if not all of us, are clearly prepared to help
22 us support the dialogue.

23 Having a forum that keeps us aligned and
24 integrated will be critically important. If the
25 Commission comes to an end when the report is
26 submitted, as I think it is currently characterized,

1 it certainly I think creates a bit of limbo about how
2 best to go work that. So I would urge that at least
3 we get some feedback from the Secretary on her
4 expectations, and I think many of us are prepared to
5 continue to serve.

6 CHAIRMAN MILLER: We'll pass that on. She
7 has a vacation scheduled now, and I told her she
8 didn't have to stay for the meeting. So she has gone
9 on to her vacation, or she would be here and be
10 listening to you. But she'll hear what you're saying.

11 Go ahead, Dr. Vedder.

12 COMMISSIONER VEDDER: Yes. When Governor
13 Hunt said the Secretary should energize the staff, I
14 thought he was going to -- I was hoping he was going
15 to say he ought to throw a party for the staff,
16 because they are much deserving of some sort of
17 accolades for their tremendous work.

18 And also, Governor Hunt said earlier
19 something that as we get into the implementation
20 stage, and I completely agree with Art Rothkopf who
21 set the tone for this discussion with Chuck, and Bob
22 Zemsky who I have actually grown to like and even
23 agree with on occasion as this process has gone along,
24 which is somewhat unexpected, that I think Governor
25 Hunt mentioned something earlier that in terms of
26 implementation we cannot forget that a lot of what

1 higher education does is at the state level.

2 We talked for example about moving to more
3 emphasis on need-based financial aid. A lot of these
4 financial aid programs are state-based programs. The
5 Georgia Hope Scholarship Program is a model for many
6 other states. We need to get in the state
7 legislatures. And of course, obviously, some people
8 are better in some states than others, given their
9 geographic locations.

10 But I think in pledging, not only should
11 we agree to come to Washington and testify before
12 Congress, which is of course important, and write for
13 editorial boards, meet with editorial boards, and all
14 of that other stuff, all of that is very important.
15 But we need to get out where the action is.

16 Still, two-thirds of higher education in
17 the United States is publicly funded, and a majority
18 of the funding to the institutions themselves still
19 come at the state and local level. And we cannot
20 forget that.

21 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you.

22 Dr. Nunley.

23 COMMISSIONER NUNLEY: I want to affirm
24 what Dr. Vedder just said as a person who spends a lot
25 of time in those state legislatures and as a person
26 who looked at Maryland performance on the Measuring Up

1 report and found our affordability measure very low,
2 and was told the reason why was because our state
3 support for need-based aid was so low. And so we do
4 need to make sure that the power of these
5 recommendations be carried forward.

6 I would make one other comment. As a
7 college President, I cannot ever remember an idea or
8 concept that has been brought forward that met with
9 universal acclaim in my own institution. I think
10 those of us who work in higher education understand
11 the nature of deliberative dialogue that tends to go
12 on in academia. It is a good thing.

13 I believe that there will be dissension,
14 concern, conversation, around the recommendations in
15 this report, and I don't believe we should be
16 discouraged by that. I think we should be encouraged
17 by that.

18 I think planting the seeds for
19 conversation is a good thing, and ongoing dialogue and
20 debate can lead to an even better place from a very
21 good place where we are. So understanding the
22 circumstances of one institution, I can certainly
23 understand the circumstances that David Ward faces in
24 dealing with a multiplicity of institutions with
25 multiple roles.

26 But, again, I want to emphasize that part

1 of our follow-up process should be to encourage the
2 dialogue and debate and to not be overcome by the
3 dissension that may come forward, but to use that to
4 take higher education to a better place.

5 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you.

6 Sara.

7 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Mr. Chair, echoing
8 some of the comments that have been made before, I
9 have three suggestions for implementation. the first
10 is -- and we've talked -- Rich talked about it a
11 little bit. The six recommendations are so far-
12 reaching and diverse, and each involves different
13 stakeholders.

14 I do think that it would be important for
15 us to identify possible champions that could lead the
16 effort to make sure that it's coordinated and that all
17 efforts are aligned. So establishing champions for
18 all six and the accountability for implementation for
19 all six I think is important.

20 The second is I couldn't agree with Chuck
21 more. We need to have a prioritization to see which
22 are the ones that will bring us quicker results
23 sooner, and I happen to agree that the restructuring
24 of financial aid and the focusing of more resources to
25 need-based is probably important. But I think an
26 implementation plan -- and I encourage the staff to

1 think through and what order we might want to think
2 about these.

3 And then, to the point that Rick Stephens
4 was making, and others have suggested, not only is
5 there an ongoing role for us between meetings as it
6 were, but I think that the Secretary should ask us to
7 reconvene formally to gauge progress on where we are
8 and to hear from these champions on progress made, so
9 that we can understand whether more work is required
10 to get these six recommendations implemented.

11 So the three -- ownership, prioritization,
12 and then frequent checking on progress I think is
13 important for us.

14 COMMISSIONER DONOFRIO: Mr. Chairman, I
15 agree with all of what has been said by my colleagues,
16 but let me just add that we need business to support
17 this as well. We need a strong effort to get the
18 industrial sector of the country, the business sector
19 of the country, behind this initiative.

20 I commit to do that. I commit to help you
21 and the Secretary in any way and every way I can,
22 because, after all, in the end 70 percent of what
23 comes out of higher education actually ends up being
24 employed by the businesses that make up the economy of
25 the United States.

26 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you for saying

1 that, because I agree wholeheartedly with that
2 necessity as well as the goodwill that that shows,
3 because I think of all the sectors of the country they
4 understand, admire, and appreciate the value of it,
5 and need that the most. So I thank you very much for
6 bringing that up.

7 Any other comments? Bob.

8 COMMISSIONER MENDENHALL: Mr. Chairman, I
9 think during the course of our deliberations there has
10 been a lot of discussion about how much of what we're
11 recommending is mandated or pushed on institutions and
12 how much institutions can individually take the lead.

13 As one of the active university presidents
14 at the table, I want to commit our university to take
15 a leadership role in implementing the recommendations
16 of this report. We actually announced recently that
17 we're not going to increase tuition at all in the
18 current year. I don't know whether we'll be able to
19 increase productivity fast enough to keep that flat
20 forever, but that would be our goal.

21 We've also created a fund for need-based
22 scholarships specifically to allow additional students
23 in need to come to the university. You know that we
24 already measure learning and make it a condition of
25 graduation, but we've made a commitment with our board
26 to publish data on results and outcomes from the

1 university.

2 And I would just encourage my colleague
3 presidents from universities and colleges around the
4 country to join with us in taking these
5 recommendations to heart and implementing them one at
6 a time, one institution at a time, and I believe we
7 can make a great difference in higher education in
8 that way.

9 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you. That's a
10 wonderful offer and wonderful advice.

11 Dr. Madrid.

12 COMMISSIONER MADRID: Mr. Chairman, in my
13 eagerness to comment on the report, I neglected to add
14 my appreciation for your work and for the Secretary's
15 engagement in this initiative, and, of course, for the
16 staff's very good work. So I join my colleagues in
17 that.

18 I want to close by saying that I am
19 particularly heartened not only by the thrust of the
20 report with respect to addressing those folks who need
21 the most help, but I'm hoping also that the
22 institutions that are charged with this also get the
23 support that they require.

24 I'm also gratified to see that the fund
25 for the improvement of post-secondary education, which
26 I had the privilege and honor of serving as Director

1 of, has appeared in our report, and that it will be
2 refocused and revitalized and you can contribute to
3 the effort.

4 And, finally, I hope that we as a
5 Commission, with the support of the Secretary's
6 office, can get the word out to our colleagues in
7 higher education. Many years ago I served on a WICHE
8 task force, the Western Interstate Commission on
9 Higher Education task force, and produced a report. I
10 recall it was a very useful, important report
11 addressing education in the west.

12 And our Director went around the states
13 talking to people about the report, and in one
14 conversation with the Chief Executive Officer he asked
15 if the Chief Executive Officer had read it. And the
16 Chief Executive Officer said, "Not personally." And I
17 hope we don't have that kind of a situation with this
18 report. Let's make sure that people do read it.

19 Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN MILLER: Thank you very much,
21 Arturo.

22 Any other comments or observations?

23 (No response.)

24 What an efficient group, hardworking,
25 dedicated, and what a privilege and an honor for me to
26 serve with all of you. I'm committed to follow up on

1 all of these recommendations and to help you all do
2 what you offered to do. I don't feel this is the
3 final step for the Commission, even though we've made
4 the most important stage of it.

5 We ought to have a presentation process to
6 the Secretary formally when the report has been
7 finished literally, and I would guess some time in
8 mid-September. And in the meantime we're pledged to
9 continue the discussion and dialogue and the plans for
10 the future for whatever way we can support or offer
11 that, we being individually and the staff.

12 The Commission would be formally closed I
13 expect 30 days -- within 30 days after the
14 presentation of the report to the Secretary. And I'm
15 sure she's counting on you to do the things you've
16 offered to help. Again, I'm not speaking for her, but
17 I know her sense of what we've been doing, and I know
18 her enough to say that I'm sure she is counting on all
19 of you and will appreciate that contribution.

20 I think there's a large contingent of the
21 press here today. I know a lot of you have travel
22 plans. You're welcome to stay and talk to -- and use
23 the facilities. If anything -- you need any help from
24 the staff, please accept that, and have a safe and
25 comfortable journey home. And we'll all be talking
26 and communicating soon.

1 Thank you very, very much from the bottom
2 of my heart.

3 (Applause.)

4 (Whereupon, at 11:29 a.m., the proceedings in the
5 foregoing matter were adjourned.)

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13